

## Lincoln Square Synagogue Haskamah Minyan Parsha class

23<sup>rd</sup> Yahrzeit of Nathan Rosen's mother, Golda Seva Rosen, Zehava bat Mordechai v' Miriam a"h

What do we know and how do we know it? Chukat -Balak July 1, 2023

Thank you to Rabbi Chaim Brovender, Yeshivat HaMivtar & WebYeshiva for all the learning over forty years.

Thank you to Rabbi Doctor Moshe Sokolow for all the years of learning Parsha HaShavua at LSS.

Thank you to Leslie Katz for pushing me to agree to fill in. His insistence came at the same time Ron Platzer was working on filing the summer schedule for people to fill in for Rabbi Sokolow. It happened to be the parsha of Behar-Bechukotai when I was reading Leviticus 26: 26 which hit a nerve as I have spoken before about blessing after eating and being satisfied. The verse says:

בְּשִׁבְרִי לָכֶם מִטֶּה-לֶחֶם וְאִפֹּי עֶשֶׂר נָשִׁים לַחֲמֻכֶּם בְּתֵנּוֹר אֶחָד וְהָשִׁיבוּ  
לַחֲמֻכֶּם בַּמֶּשְׁקֶל וְאָכַלְתֶּם וְלֹא תִשְׂבְּעוּ: {ס}

When I break your staff of bread, ten women shall bake your bread in a single oven; they shall dole out your bread by weight, and though you eat, you shall not be satisfied.

Why will you not be satisfied?

Ibn Ezra points out two different curses from this verse, one is physical and one is psychological. The physical is the small amount of food which is inadequate and the psychological is not being satisfied from even eating a lot.

During this same time, I was learning in Rabbi Brovender's Talmud class – Yoma and we happened to be learning amod 73b - starting with Mishnah chapter 8, number 1

יּוֹם הַכְּפוּרִים אָסוּר בְּאֲכִילָה וּבִשְׁתִּיָּה וּבִרְחִיצָה וּבְסִיכָה וּבִנְעִילָת  
הַסַּנְדָּל, וּבְתַשְׁמִישׁ הַמָּטָה. וְהַמֶּלֶךְ וְהַכֹּהֵן יִרְחֲצוּ אֶת פְּנֵיהֶם, וְהַחֲזִיָּה  
תִּנְעוֹל אֶת הַסַּנְדָּל, דְּבָרֵי רַבִּי אֱלִיעֶזֶר. וְחֻכָּמִים אוֹסְרִין.

**MISHNA:** On Yom Kippur, the day on which there is a mitzva by Torah law to afflict oneself, it is **prohibited** to engage in eating and in drinking, and in bathing, and in smearing oil on one's body, and in wearing shoes, and in conjugal relations. However, the king, in

So where do we learn that you are obligated to afflict oneself on Yom Kippur and how do we determine what is required to afflict oneself?

Yoma 76a

אָסוּר בְּאֵכִילָה. הֲנִי חֲמִשָּׁה עֲנוּיִין כְּנֶגֶד מִי? אָמַר רַב חֲסִידָא: כְּנֶגֶד  
חֲמִשָּׁה עֲנוּיִין שְׁבִיתוּרָה: "וּבַעֲשׂוֹר", "וְ"אֵךְ בַּעֲשׂוֹר", "שִׁבְתָּ שְׁבִיתוֹן",  
וְ"שִׁבְתָּ שְׁבִיתוֹן", "וְהִיתָה לָּכֶם".

§ The mishna taught that as per the five prohibited activities on Yom Kippur it is **prohibited** to engage in **eating** and in drinking, and in bathing, and in smearing the body with oil, and in wearing shoes, and in conjugal relations. The Gemara asks: **These five afflictions** of Yom Kippur, to **what** do they **correspond**? Where is the Torah source or allusion to them? **Rav Hisda said:** They are based on **the five** times that the **afflictions** of Yom Kippur are mentioned **in the Torah**. It is stated:

Leviticus, 16:29

וְהִיתָה לָּכֶם לַחֲקֹת עוֹלָם בַּחֹדֶשׁ הַשְּׁבִיעִי בַּעֲשׂוֹר לַחֹדֶשׁ תַּעֲנּוּ  
אֶת־נַפְשֵׁיכֶם וְכָל־מְלָאכָה לֹא תַעֲשׂוּ הָאֲזִלָּה וְהִגֵּר הִגֵּר בְּתוֹכְכֶם:

Leviticus, 23:27

אֵךְ בַּעֲשׂוֹר לַחֹדֶשׁ הַשְּׁבִיעִי הַזֶּה יוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים הוּא מְקַרֵּא־קֹדֶשׁ יְהִיָּה  
לָכֶם וְעֲנִיתֶם אֶת־נַפְשֵׁיכֶם וְהִקְרַבְתֶּם אֵלֶּה God

Translation	16:29	23:27
JPS old, The JPS Miqraot Gedolot	And it shall be a statute of rever unto you: in the seventh month, on the tenth day of the month, ye shall afflict your souls, and shall do no manner of work,	Howbeit on the tenth day of this seventh month is the day of atonement; there shall be a holy convocation unto you, and ye shall afflict your souls; and ye shall bring an offering made by fire unto the Lord.
JPS new, The JPS Miqraot Gedolot	And this shall be to you a law for all time: In the seventh month, on the tenth day of the month, you shall practice self-denial; and you shall do no manner of work.	Mark, the tenth day o this seventh month is the Day of Atonement. It shall be a sacred occasion for you; you shall practice self-denial, and you shall bring an offering by fire to the Lord.
Aryeh Kaplan, The Living Torah	All this shall be an eternal law for you. Each year on the 10 <sup>th</sup> day of the 7 <sup>th</sup> month you must fast and not do any work.	The 10 <sup>th</sup> of this seventh month shall be the Day of Atonement for you. It is a sacred holiday when you must fast and bring a fire offering to G-d.
Everett Fox, The Five Books of Moses	And it shall be for you a law for the ages: in the seventh New Moon, on the tenth day after the New Moon you are to afflict yourselves (a)	Mark, on the tenth day after this seventh New Moon, it is the day of Atonement, a proclamation of holiness shall there be for you. You are to afflict yourselves...
Robert Alter, The Five Books of Moses	And it shall be a perpetual statute for you: in the seventh month on the tenth of the month you shall afflict yourselves (b)	Yet on the tenth of this seventh month is the day of atonement, a sacred convocation it shall be for you, and you shall afflict yourselves and bring forward a firm offering to the Lord. (c)
Stone, ArtScroll The Chumash	This shall remain for you an eternal decree: In the seventh month, on the tenth of the month, you shall afflict yourselves and shall not do any work. (d)	But on the tenth day of this seventh month it is the Day of Atonement; there shall be a holy convocation , and you shall afflict yourselves and offer a fire offering to Hashem. [e]
Adin Even-Israel Steinsaltz, The Steinsaltz Humash (bold is direct translation and non-bold explanation included into the text)	<b>It shall be for you an eternal statue: During the seventh month,</b> which later became known as Tishrei, <b>on the tenth of the month,</b> Yom Kippur, <b>you shall afflict yourselves.</b> This is not a command to cause oneself unnecessary suffering, rather, “afflict yourselves” is a technical term meaning that one must refrain from eating, drinking, and other specific forms of physical pleasure.	<b>However on the tenth day of this seventh month, Tishrei, is the Day of Atonement</b> for the Jewish people, which is a different kind of festival. <b>A holy convocation it shall be for you. An you shall afflict yourselves.</b> The form of this affliction is not explained here. However, it seems that the verse is not instructing one to inflict upon himself any possible form of suffering, but to abstain from food, drink, and other common forms of physical pleasure. These are referred to here literally as “afflictions of the soul”.

#### Footnotes to the translation of the verses

- (a) **Afflict your selves** – Virtually all commentators (and Jewish tradition) interpret this as a reference to fasting.
  - (b) **Afflict yourselves** – The evident meaning is fasting, though some have contended that the idiom is not restricted to fasting but could also represent other forms of self-denial.
  - (c) **You shall afflict yourselves** – In legal-cultic contexts, this idiom refers primarily to fasting, a meaning perhaps reinforced by the fact that the noun in question, the ubiquitous nefesh, can also mean both “throat” and “appetite”, though its most plausible sense in context is simply as an intensive form of the pronoun.
  - (d) **You shall afflict yourselves.** The Sages expound that the expression afflict refers only abstention from food and drink (Yoma 74b). Wherever Scripture associates self with affliction, it refers to fasting. This is how the Sages derive that our verse requires fasting rather than some other form of affliction (Ibn Ezra).
- [e] **And you shall afflict.** This is the Torah’s term for fasting.

#### Additional references to afflict

Translation	Numbers 29:7	Leviticus 16:31	Leviticus 23:32
JPS old,	ye shall afflict your souls	ye shall afflict your souls	ye shall afflict your souls
JPS new	you shall practice self-denial	you shall practice self-denial	you shall practice self-denial
Kaplan	you must fast	you must fast	you must fast
Fox	you are to afflict yourselves	you are to afflict yourselves	you are to afflict yourselves
Alter,	you shall afflict yourselves	you shall afflict yourselves	you shall afflict yourselves
Stone	you shall afflict yourselves	you shall afflict yourselves	you shall afflict yourselves
Steinsaltz	<b>you shall afflict your souls</b> by fasting	<b>And you shall afflict yourselves.</b> Yom Kippur is a day of cessation not only from prohibited labor, but also from attending to one’s general physical needs.	<b>And you shall afflict yourselves</b>

Ibn Ezra on Leviticus 16:29:2

IN THE SEVENTH MONTH, ON THE TENTH DAY OF THE MONTH, YE SHALL AFFLICT YOUR SOULS. Since Scripture writes, *And let your soul delight itself in fatness* (Is. 55:2), we know that affliction is the reverse of delight and that affliction of the soul refers to fasting.<sup>105</sup> Furthermore, Scripture states, *And satisfy the afflicted soul* (Is. 58:10), the meaning of which is like *And if thou draw out thy soul to the hungry* (Ibid.), for it is the style of the prophets to repeat themselves.<sup>106</sup> Now since we have tradition<sup>107</sup> there is no reason to go on searching.<sup>108</sup> *I afflicted my soul with fasting* (Ps. 35:13) is no proof<sup>109</sup> because the word fast is mentioned.<sup>110</sup> The general rule is, whenever we find in Scripture the word affliction connected to soul, the reference is to a fast.<sup>111</sup>

הַיְנִי חֲמִשָּׁה הֵווּ? וְאֵינָן שְׂיִתָּא תִּנּוּ! שְׂתִיָּה בְּכֻלָּל אֲכִילָה הִיא. דָּאָמַר רִישׁ לָקִישׁ: מִנֵּין לְשְׂתִיָּה שֶׁהִיא בְּכֻלָּל אֲכִילָה, שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר: "וְאָכַלְתָּ לִפְנֵי ה' אֱלֹהֶיךָ מַעֲשֵׂר דִּגְגֶנְךָ תִּירוֹשֶׁךָ וְיֵצֶהָ־רֶךְ", תִּירוֹשׁ חֲמָרָא הוּא, וְקָרִי לִיה "וְאָכַלְתָּ".

The Gemara asks: **Are these five** the only afflictions? **We learn** in the mishna that there are **six**: Eating, drinking, bathing, smearing oil, conjugal relations, and wearing shoes. The Gemara answers: **Drinking is included in** the prohibition of **eating**; both together are considered a single affliction. **As Reish Lakish said: From where do we derive that**

הָאוֹכֵל כְּכֹתֶבֶת הַגֶּסֶה, כְּמוֹהָ וּכְגִרְעִינָתָהּ, וְהַשּׂוֹתֶה מְלֵא לִוְגָּמִי — חַיִּיב. כָּל הָאוֹכְלִים מִצְטָרְפִין לְכְּכֹתֶבֶת, וְכָל הַמְּשִׁקִּין מִצְטָרְפִין לְמֵלֵא לִוְגָּמִי. הָאוֹכֵל וְשׂוֹתֶה אֵין מִצְטָרְפִין.

The mishna elaborates: **One who eats a large date-bulk** of food, equivalent to a date **and its pit, or who drinks a cheekful** of liquid on Yom Kippur is **liable** to receive the punishment of *karet* for failing to fulfill the mitzva to afflict oneself on Yom Kippur. **All foods** that one eats **join** together to constitute **a date-bulk**; **and all liquids** that one drinks **join** together to constitute **a cheekful**. However, if **one eats and drinks**, the food and beverage **do not join** together to constitute a measure that determines liability, as each is measured separately.

עֲנִי נֶפֶשׁ. From *Yeshayahu* 58:3 and 58:5 it is evident that עֲנִי is identical with צָר. It is also evident from what is written there in verse 10 — וְנָפַשׁ נֶעְנָה חֶסֶד — that עֲנִי נֶפֶשׁ is the opposite of שׂוֹכֵחַ. Its literal meaning is to impoverish the נֶפֶשׁ, to deny the נֶפֶשׁ the means of its existence. This amounts to a prohibition of eating and drinking.

The Halachah states explicitly: יָכוֹל יֵשֵׁב בַּחֲמָה אוֹ בַצָּנָה כְּדֵי שִׁיצִטֵּעַ וְכִי (Yoma 74b). That is to say, the mitzvah is not to actively cause pain and suffering; rather, the mitzvah is only to *abstain* from pleasures, just as אִסּוּר מְלָאכָה entails *abstention* from creative work. Hence, the common translation of עֲנִי as affliction is definitely misleading; for the Latin source *affligere* denotes causing pain and suffering.

In a wider sense, עֲנִי includes abstention from other forms of pleasure, beside eating and drinking: רְחִיצָה, סִיכָה, נְעִילַת הַסִּנְדֵּל, וְחֲשִׁמִּישׁ הַמָּטָה. However, it is not resolved whether this extension of the concept of עֲנִי is דְּרַבְנָן or דְּאִוֵּרִיחָא.

But right away the Gemara Yoma 73b points out an interesting use of language

גִּמְ' אִסּוּר? עֲנִי שְׂכָרָה הוּא! אָמַר רַבִּי אֵילָא, וְאִתִּימָא רַבִּי יְרֵמְיָה:  
לֹא נִצְרָקָה אֵלָא לְחֻצֵי שִׁיעוּר.

**GEMARA:** The Gemara expresses surprise at the mishna's terminology, which states that it is prohibited to eat and drink on Yom Kippur. Why does the mishna use the word **prohibited**, which indicates that these activities are only sinful? It is, after all, **punishable by karet** if he eats, and the mishna should have used the more accurate word **liable**. **Rabbi Ila said, and some say that Rabbi Yirmeya said:** This term is needed **only for a half-measure**, meaning that if one eats less than the amount that incurs the punishment of *karet*, he still violates a prohibition.

Yoma 73b

הִנִּיחָא לְמֵאן דְּאָמַר חֻצֵי שִׁיעוּר אִסּוּר מִן הַתּוֹרָה, אֵלָא לְמֵאן דְּאָמַר  
חֻצֵי שִׁיעוּר מוֹתֵר מִן הַתּוֹרָה, מַאי אִיכָא לְמִימַר?

The Gemara asks: This explanation **works out well according to the one who said that a half-measure is prohibited by Torah law** even though it does not incur a punishment. **But according to the one who says that a half-measure is permitted by Torah law**, and that it is the Sages who prohibit eating less than a full measure, **what is there to say** about the terminology?

The Commentators' Bible on Leviticus 16:29 Nahmanides – You shall practice self-denial. Ibn Ezra has nicely explained the nature of this self-denial, thus stopping up the mouths of the Karaites, may their name be blotted out.

How do we get from affliction to fasting?

Yoma 74b using Leviticus 23:30 to affliction is refraining from eating and drinking

וְאִם נִפְשָׁךְ לֹאמַר, הֲרִי הוּא אוֹמֵר: "וְהָאֲבִדְתִּי אֶת הַנֶּפֶשׁ הַזֶּה", עֲנוּי  
שֶׁהוּא אֲבִידַת הַנֶּפֶשׁ, וְאִי זֶה זֶה? זֶה אֲכִילָה וְשִׁתִּיָּה.

And if it is your wish to say something to challenge this reasoning, the Gemara brings an additional proof: Surely, the verse states with regard to one who violates Yom Kippur: “I will destroy that soul from among his people” (Leviticus 23:30). Therefore, affliction is something that destroys a soul. And what is that? That is refraining from eating and drinking, since someone who does not eat and drink at all will die. The Torah is not referring to other afflictions that do not lead to death. These are the words of the *baraita*.

Yoma 74b using Deuteronomy 8:3 that afflicted is causing hunger

דְּבִי רַבִּי יִשְׁמָעֵאל תֵּנָּא: נֹאמַר כָּאן עֲנוּי, וְנֹאמַר לְהֵלֶן עֲנוּי. מָה לְהֵלֶן  
עֲנוּי רָעִבּוֹן, אִף כָּאן עֲנוּי רָעִבּוֹן.

The school of Rabbi Yishmael taught the following concerning the nature of Yom Kippur: The word affliction is stated here with regard to Yom Kippur, and the word affliction is stated further on in a different place, concerning the Jews in the desert: “And He afflicted you and caused you to hunger” (Deuteronomy 8:3). Just as further on the meaning of affliction is hunger, so too, here, the meaning of the word affliction is hunger.

Eating was the first sin as God said to Adam not to eat from the tree of good and evil. So appropriate to repent by not eating as a reminder of that 1<sup>st</sup> sin and to repair the sin.

Fasting in Jewish tradition has a number of reasons – both communal and personal including piety, supplication, mourning and atonement.

Affliction for Yom Kippur is generally thought of feeling distress or avoidance of pleasure – both connected in some way to act of sinning. Alternative it is putting the material part of man to rest. Abandoning one's most important bodily functions to elevate the person in a spiritual dimension. Interestingly Rambam put YK right after Shabbat and calls it Laws of Resting on the 10<sup>th</sup> day. Rambam, rather than focusing on causing distress but of refraining from bodily functions.

Footnote to Stone, ArtScroll The Chumash Leviticus, 16:29

It is noteworthy that in giving the laws of Yom Kippur, Rambam does not speak of fasting or affliction. Rather he writes: There is a further positive commandment on Yom Kippur. It is to rest from eating and drinking. It is forbidden to bathe, to apply oil to the body, to wear shoes or to cohabit. It is a positive commandment to rest from all of these just as it is commanded to rest from eating.

Rambam's choice of words is significant. He states that on Yom Kippur one "rests" from the listed activities, which indicates that the purpose of fasting is not that one should suffer, but that he should transcend the normal human limitations that prevent him from functioning properly unless he eats. On Yom Kippur a Jew is like an angel who services G-d without need for food. ... Fasting's greatest value is when it is associated with repentance, and the purpose of the fast is to elevate Jews, not to cause them physical deprivation.

### **Mishnah Berurah, Laws of Rosh Ha-Shanah and Yom Kippur**

Section 612 – The prohibition against eating on Yom Kippur and the minimum amount for which one is culpable.

1 – If one ate on Yom Kippur the bulk of a large date, he is culpable for this. The bulk of a large date is a little less than an egg's bulk.

Mishnah Berurah (1) **The bulk of a large date.** Although with respect to all other Torah prohibitions the minimum amount that gives rise to culpability is the bulk of an olive, this minimum amount is solely relevant in cases where the prohibition is written in the Torah in relation to eating. This is not the case with the prohibition against eating on Yom Kippur. With reference to Yom Kippur it is not written that eating is forbidden, but eating on Yom Kippur was precluded by Scripture through the term "affliction", since with respect to Yom Kippur it is written, "the person who will be afflicted.... The Sages were sure that if one eats less than the bulk of a large date one does not become content at all, but is hungry and afflicted as he was originally.

(3) **This minimum among applies equally.** This is because the Sages were sure that by eating this amount everyone becomes content, whether to a small or to a large extent, but by eating less than this amount nobody becomes content. Now even if one eats a slight amount this involves transgression of a prohibition, as stated below in par 5. The reason why the author of the Shulchan Aruch instructs us of the minimum amount for which there is culpability, despite this, is because this amount is of practical importance with respond to what is mention in sec 618 concerning an ill person.

5 – The requirement of a minimum amount relates to culpability for kareyes (divine capital punishment) or to bring a sing offering (11) , but the transgression of a prohibition is involved however little one eats.

**(11) But a prohibition is involved.** i.e. prohibition which derives from Torah law.

### **Sefer HaHinnuch by Rabbi Pinhas HaLevi of Barcelona section 313 – Fasting on the 10<sup>th</sup> of Tishri**

Focus not on the affliction but on kindness of God to set aside one day to atone for sins and repent. Avoiding pleasure of the body and focus on the spirit of wisdom.

Makes an interesting distinction regarding minimal amount of food for punishment – bulky date rather than general olive.

Focus is rather not on the command Not to eat but affliction because quantity of date or person's spirit is not assuaged.

## **Have actual food but still affliction**

”הַמֵּאֲכִילְךָ מִן בִּמְדֹבָר לִמְעַן עֲנוּתְךָ”, רַבִּי אֲמִי וְרַבִּי אֲסִי: חֵד אָמַר: אֵינוּ דוֹמָה מִי שֵׁישׁ לוֹ פֶּת בְּסֵלֹו לְמִי שֶׁאֵין לוֹ פֶּת בְּסֵלֹו, וְחֵד אָמַר: אֵינוּ דוֹמָה מִי שֶׁרוֹאֶה וְאֹכֵל לְמִי שֶׁאֵינוּ רוֹאֶה וְאֹכֵל.

§ Apropos the verse: “And he afflicted you and caused you to hunger, and fed you with manna” (Deuteronomy 8:3), the Gemara expounds related verses. The Torah states: “**Who feeds you manna in the desert** which your fathers did not know, **in order to afflict you**” (Deuteronomy 8:16). What affliction was there in eating the manna? **Rabbi Ami and Rabbi Asi** disagreed on the matter. **One said: There is no comparison between one who has bread in his basket and one who does not have bread in his basket.** The affliction in eating the manna lay in there being no leftover food for the next day. Each day the people worried that they might not have any food to eat the next day. **And one said: There is no comparison between one who sees the food and eats it and one who does not see the food and eats it.** Though the manna could taste like anything, it always looked the same and did not look as it tasted. Being unable to see the food that they tasted was an affliction.

אָמַר רַב יוֹסֵף: מִכָּאֵן רָמַז לְסוּמִין שֶׁאֹכְלִין וְאֵין שְׂבָעִין. אָמַר אַבְי: הִלְכָּךְ, מֵאֵן דָּאִית לִיה סְעוּדָתָא – לֹא לִיכְלָה אֱלָא בִּימָמָא. אָמַר רַבִּי זִירָא: מַאי קָרָא? “טוֹב מִרְאֶה עֵינִים מִהֲלֹךְ נַפֶּשׁ”. אָמַר רִישׁ לְקִישׁ: טוֹב מִרְאֶה עֵינִים בְּאִשָּׁה יוֹתֵר מִגּוּפּוֹ שֶׁל מַעֲשֶׂה, שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר: “טוֹב מִרְאֶה עֵינִים מִהֲלֹךְ נַפֶּשׁ”.

Rav Yosef said: From here there is an **allusion** to the idea **that blind people eat but are not fully satisfied** when they eat because they cannot see their food. Seeing the food contributes to the enjoyment of eating. **Abaye said: Therefore, from what we have just learned, one who has a meal should eat it only during daytime**, when there is light to see the food that is being eaten. **Rabbi Zeira said: What is the verse that alludes to this? “Better is the seeing of the eyes than the wandering of the desire”** (Ecclesiastes 6:9). On the same verse, **Reish Lakish said: The sight of a woman is better than the actual act of relations, as it is stated: “Better is the seeing of the eyes than the wandering of the desire.”**

What do we know and how do we know it?

We know that fasting is required on Yom Kippur – everyone knew that and it was observed from the earliest time.

But one might ask how do we know that. Is it written in the Torah? If not, then Karaites, Christians and others might say that it is not required.

So response is to find support in the Torah for what is meant by affliction. Is it five because of the five mentions of affliction or do we learn what is affliction from the context of the word.

During the investigation process, we gain insight into what it might mean by affliction.

- Is having NO food the only criteria of affliction
- Or is having too little food sufficient
- Or is uncertainty of where the next meal will be coming from
- Or if we can't see the food

Conclusion is that affliction can be both a physical and intellectual condition. So the opposite of affliction could be satisfaction. Or is YK rest from the physical and focus on the spiritual.

We learned previously that eat and be satisfied is both psychological and physical as the amount to be officially satisfied is tiny and fundamentally a function of perception.

As it is said in Proverbs 10:7 "The memory of the righteous is blessed" and I am truly blessed with the memory of my mother Golda Seva Rosen.